

**CITY OF BIRMINGHAM
PLANNING BOARD ACTION ITEMS
OF WEDNESDAY, JULY 25, 2018**

Item	Page
EXTENSION OF APPROVED SITE PLAN	
1. 277 Pierce (former Varsity Shop Building) Request to extend the approved Final Site Plan which will expire on August 23, 2018	2
Motion by Mr. Koseck Seconded by Mr. Williams that the extension of the site plan for 277 Pierce should be to February 23, 2019, which is six months from the original approval's expiration date of August 23, 2018, with the following conditions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant agrees to immediately register the existing building as a vacant building with the Building Department; and • Applicant also obtain an approval for an extension of the Historic Design approval from the Historic District Commission. 	2
Motion carried, 7-0.	2
REVISED FINAL SITE PLAN REVIEW	
1. 298 S. Old Woodward Ave., The Daxton Hotel (former Doctors House Calls) Request for design and material changes to the exterior of the building	3
Motion by Ms. Whipple-Boyce Seconded by Mr. Koseck to approve the Revised Final Site Plan and Design Review for 298 S. Old Woodward Ave. as follows:	3
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Darker stucco color change with respect to the penthouse, subject to administrative approval; • Approve the use of cast stone for the exterior; • Approve the metal railing to match the window cladding; • Approve the sidewalk in the via; • Approve the modifications to the second floor layout at the garden level by reducing the number of rooms that extend out to two rooms. 	5
Motion carried, 7-0.	
STUDY SESSION	
1. Retail Discussion Motion by Mr. Williams Seconded by Mr. Emerine to forward this proposed RFP along to the City Commission for their consideration.	5

Item	Page
Motion carried, 7-0.	6
2. Residential Parking Requirements	
Motion by Mr. Boyle	
Seconded by Mr. Williams to move the proposed RFP on parking standards to the City Commission with the suggested changes as noted this evening.	6
Motion carried, 7-0.	6
3. Sign Ordinance Review	7
Motion by Mr. Williams	
Seconded by Mr. Boyle that the Planning Board set a public hearing date of September 12, 2018 to consider eliminating the Overlay Sign Standards in Article 03, section 3.04 (f) of the Zoning Ordinance. Minutes from the HDC and DRB will be included at the time of the public hearing and the materials will be made available to the public and to the Planning Board.	7
Motion carried, 7-0.	7
	8
	8

**CITY OF BIRMINGHAM
REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING BOARD
WEDNESDAY, JULY 25, 2018**
City Commission Room
151 Martin Street, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the City of Birmingham Planning Board held on July 25, 2018. Chairman Scott Clein convened the meeting at 7:30 p.m.

Present: Chairman Scott Clein; Board Members Robin Boyle, Bert Koseck, Janelle Whipple-Boyce, Bryan Williams; Alternate Board Members Jason Emerine, Nasseem Ramin; Student Representative Ellie McElroy (arrived at 7:42 p.m.)

Absent: Board Members Stuart Jeffares, Daniel Share; Student Representatives Madison Dominato, Sam Fogel

Administration: Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner
Brooks Cowan, Planner
Jana Ecker, Planning Director
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

07-128-18

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR PLANNING BOARD MEETING OF JULY 11, 2018

Motion by Mr. Williams

Seconded by Ms. Whipple-Boyce to approve the Minutes of the Regular Planning Board Meeting of July 11, 2018 as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Williams, Whipple-Boyce, Clein, Emerine, Koseck

Nays: None

Abstain: Boyle, Koseck

Absent: Jeffares, Share

07-129-18

CHAIRPERSON'S COMMENTS (none)

07-130-18

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA (no change)

EXTENSION OF APPROVED SITE PLAN

1. 277 Pierce (former Varsity Shop Building)
Request to extend the approved Final Site Plan which will expire on August 23, 2018

Ms. Ecker recalled that on August 23, 2017, the above-captioned property was granted Final Site Plan and Design Review approval by the Planning Board to construct a new five-story mixed-use building. This project was also approved by the Historic District Commission as it is located in the Central Business Historic District.

The Zoning Ordinance provides that a site plan is valid for one year from the date of approval. Accordingly, the applicant is requesting an extension of the site plan for 277 Pierce, as they require additional time to obtain tenants to occupy the new building.

Given the fact that the existing building has not been demolished at this time, the Planning Division recommends that should the Planning Board grant a site plan extension, the following conditions be added:

- Applicant agrees to immediately register the existing building as a vacant building with the Building Dept; and
- Applicant also obtain an approval for an extension of the Historic Design approval from the Historic District Commission.

Ms. Eavan Yaldo, Saroki Architecture, was present on behalf of Kajoian Management. She explained that with the conditions of the five-story mixed-use in the D-4 Overlay Zoning they are looking at retail components for the first and second floors. They are trying to get a two-story retailer if possible.

Discussion among the board members followed as to how long the extension should be.

Motion by Mr. Koseck

Seconded by Mr. Williams that the extension of the site plan for 277 Pierce should be to February 23, 2019, which is six months from the original approval's expiration date of August 23, 2018, with the following conditions:

- **Applicant agrees to immediately register the existing building as a vacant building with the Building Department; and**
- **Applicant also obtain an approval for an extension of the Historic Design approval from the Historic District Commission.**

There were no public comments at 7:40 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Koseck, Williams, Boyle, Clein, Emerine, Ramin, Whipple-Boyce

Nays: None

Absent: Jeffares, Share

REVISED FINAL SITE PLAN REVIEW

1. 298 S. Old Woodward Ave., The Daxton Hotel (former Doctors House Calls) Request for design and material changes to the exterior of the building

Chairman Clein announced that he would be recusing himself on this project as he has to date because his firm is involved. Therefore, he turned the gavel over to Mr. Williams.

Mr. Baka recalled the subject site, 298 S. Old Woodward, covers .618 acres in the Downtown Overlay on the northwest corner of Brown St. and S. Old Woodward Ave. The site was previously approved to construct a 25,182 sq. ft., five-story mixed-use building. The building will provide ground floor retail, 3 floors of hotel guest rooms, and 17 residential units on the fifth floor. Parking for the residential units will be provided in the subterranean levels of the building.

The applicant has submitted for a Revised Final Site Plan review to change exterior materials present on the building façade. The applicant is now proposing to cover the main façade with cast stone and the residential fifth floor facade is proposed to now be constructed of coarsely textured stucco. The applicant is also proposing to pave the via to the north of the property to match the exposed aggregate used in the S. Old Woodward Ave. reconstruction project. Finally, the applicant is proposing to reconfigure rooms on the second floor of the hotel to reduce the bump out into the open space of the green roof above the first floor. As a result, the number and size of the proposed skylights has changed as well.

Design Review

The revised Final Site Plan & Design Review application submitted by the applicant is proposing a change to the materials that comprise the façade of the building. The approved materials that are proposed to be changed are:

- Stone cladding on floors 1-4;
- Coated metal cladding on the 5th floor;
- Coated metal window surrounds on floors 1-4;
- Coated metal cladding in between windows on floors 1-3.

The new materials proposed to replace the former materials, in corresponding order, are:

- Cast stone wall assembly on floors 1-4 (Mix 2169 from Arch. Cast Stone);
- Coarsely textured stucco wall assembly on the 5th floor;
- Cast stone window surrounds on floors 1-4;
- Cast stone spandrels in between windows on floors 1-3 (Mix 1438 from Arch. Cast Stone).

Mr. Charlie Stetson, Principal at Booth Hansen Architects, described the proposed revisions:

- The reason for the change to cast stone on the facade is that they were having trouble getting limestone samples that were consistent with the desired texture and color. Cast stone can be very consistent across the entire building. The field which is lighter grey limestone is proposed to be lighter grey cast stone. Also, the spandrels in the window surrounds will go to a darker grey cast stone.
- The fifth floor is proposed to be rough textured stucco to match the stone as closely as possible.

- For the via they propose to match the paving of the new S. Old Woodward Ave. construction project streetscape by removing the previously proposed stone pavers in favor of exposed aggregate.
- A metal picket railing painted the same color as the mullions for the windows, as well as the screenwall around the mechanical, is proposed around the fifth floor. Ms. Ecker advised that a condition of the original approval was that the previously proposed glass railings are not permitted in the Downtown Overlay.
- They have extended the cornice at the top of the first floor all the way around the building. It is the darker of the two stones and makes the building more unified.
- The corner terrace rooms previously extended out into the second-floor roof area and resulted in a less than ideal room layout. So they propose to modify that portion of the building to eliminate the terrace rooms altogether.

Mr. Boyle inquired if any other finish was considered for the railing, such as stainless steel. Mr. Stetson explained these will be very thin bars and will not be very visible.

Mr. Koseck did not have an issue with the dark railing, as he thought it would almost go away. Mr. Stetson verified for him that proposed cast stone units are the same size as the original limestone. Mr. Koseck said he was disappointed that the building seems watered down from the original approval. He preferred a darker stucco for the penthouse that isn't trying to match the stone. Mr. Stetson said he will consider the darker material and bring it up to their design team. He added that the detailing of the building will give it a crisp feeling.

Ms. Whipple-Boyce commented she was a little disappointed about the change from the limestone to the cast stone. She was in support of the metal railing and the color change to the darker stucco because it would cause the metal railing to almost go away.

Motion by Ms. Whipple-Boyce

Seconded by Mr. Koseck to approve the Revised Final Site Plan and Design Review for 298 S. Old Woodward Ave. as follows:

- **Darker stucco color change with respect to the penthouse, subject to administrative approval;**
- **Approve the use of cast stone for the exterior;**
- **Approve the metal railing to match the window cladding;**
- **Approve the sidewalk in the via;**
- **Approve the modifications to the second floor layout at the garden level by reducing the number of rooms that extend out to two rooms.**

There were no comments from members of the public at 8 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Whipple-Boyce, Koseck, Boyle, Emerine, Ramin, Williams

Nays: None

Recused: Clein

Absent: Jeffares, Share

STUDY SESSION

1. Retail Discussion

Chairman Clein rejoined the meeting.

Mr. Cowan recalled the Planning Board has been studying the Redline Retail District since January. They brought their findings to the City Commission and asked to bring in a retail consultant. The Planning Dept. has now prepared an RFP for a retail consultant for the Planning Board to review.

On July 11, 2018, the Planning Dept. presented the first draft of the RFP to the Planning Board. The Board's suggestions from that meeting have been incorporated into tonight's draft.

Mr. Boyle did not understand why the word "Line" is included in the title, "Retail Frontage Line Review." Mr. Cowan replied that he went by the definitions from the Zoning Ordinance. Board members concluded that the title should be changed to omit "Line" and reworded to "Downtown Retail Review".

Mr. Williams concluded with regard to SCOPE OF WORK (5) Trends in Retail and Projections, that the scope of retail is changing rapidly and the projection should be for up to 10 years.

Chairman Clein said his only concern with SCOPE OF WORK (7) Coordinate Public Engagement, is they are specifically prescribing how many meetings will be held. Perhaps say that it is a minimum of two public engagement meetings to receive feedback. The suggestion was to substitute "meetings" with "activities." That would give the consultant the opportunity to do different things. Everyone liked that idea.

Mr. Williams pointed out that getting the public to engage is critical to getting public buy-in.

Ms. Ecker provided language for SCOPE OF WORK (7) Coordinate Public Engagement: "The Contractor will be expected to host two (2) public engagement activities to receive input and engage the public related to the Retail Frontage Line policy . . ." Further, for SCOPE OF WORK (7) Attendance at Meetings (c), change "meetings" to "activities."

Motion by Mr. Williams

Seconded by Mr. Emerine to forward this proposed RFP along to the City Commission for their consideration.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Williams, Emerine, Boyle, Clein, Koseck, Ramin, Whipple-Boyce

Nays: None

Absent: Jeffares, Share

07-123-18

2. Parking Requirements

Ms. Ecker noted that on July 11, 2018, the Planning Board reviewed the draft amendments to eliminate residential parking requirements discussed at their joint meeting with the City

Commission on June 18, 2018. Several board members expressed concern that parking requirements for single-family residential uses should not be eliminated throughout the whole City. Rather, the focus should be on the mixed-use areas in the Downtown, the Triangle and Rail Districts. In addition, the RFP should be broadened so as not to just study the residential parking standards, but look at parking requirements for other uses as well. Also, the board had directed staff to add the objective that the reason for the study is to try to increase the density of residential in those three mixed-use areas and also to encourage smaller, more affordable units within those areas.

Also on July 11, 2018, board members stated that the study should also include current and future parking trends and best practices for parking standards to achieve the desired mix of residential and other uses in similar walkable communities to Birmingham.

A revised draft RFP for a parking standards study incorporating the Planning Board's comments from the July 11, 2018 meeting was presented. Ms. Ecker suggested the idea of having the order of meetings set out as it is in the Retail RFP.

Mr. Boyle asked if there is some language that ties this study in with the Master Plan. Ms. Ecker thought the sense of the City Commission was that it should be separate. She said both of the RFPs that are looked at tonight are designed to be handled much quicker than the Master Plan process because the Commission sensed more urgency on those issues. Also, It is a good idea to acknowledge somewhere in these documents that the City is also embarking on a Master Planning Project.

Mr. Boyle suggested that language be added that demonstrates to the consultant that this study is part of a portfolio of policy activity that the City is engaging in with urgency on retail and equal importance for parking, building up to a Master Plan process.

**Motion by Mr. Boyle
Seconded by Mr. Williams to move the proposed RFP on parking standards to the City Commission with the suggested changes as noted this evening.**

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Boyle, Williams, Clein, Emerine, Koseck, Ramin, Whipple-Boyce

Nays: None

Absent: Jeffares, Share

07-124-18

3. Sign Ordinance Review

Mr. Baka recalled at the July 11, 2018 Planning Board meeting various issues regarding signage and windows were discussed. Specifically, the issue of the conflicts between the Standard Sign Ordinance and the Overlay Ordinance was discussed. Having two sets of signage standards has made interpretation and enforcement difficult. This issue has led to an inordinate number of variance requests recently.

In addition, staff noted that the Overlay Signage Standards appear in both the Sign Ordinance and the Zoning Ordinance, which is redundant and would require public hearings for both documents in order to make any changes. At the July 11, 2018 meeting there appeared to be

consensus that having signage regulations in both documents was not necessary and that eliminating the Overlay Sign Standards from the Zoning Ordinance would be a first step towards correcting the issues being created by having multiple sets of regulations.

Accordingly, the Planning Division has now provided an ordinance amendment that would eliminate the Overlay Signage Standards from the Zoning Ordinance.

Chairman Clein said this needs to be presented by this Board to the City Commission as step one. Ms. Ecker added if this Board decides there should only be one Sign Ordinance, and therefore the Zoning Ordinance Overlay Signage Standards should be eliminated, then a motion to that effect should be directed to the Design Review Board ("DRB"). Then the DRB can provide their comments on what may need to be changed in the Standard Sign Standards before going to the Commission.

Mr. Baka advised that the DRB and the Historic District Commission ("HDC") had a study session and there was consensus that the Overlay Signage Standards should change and they felt there should be an opportunity to look at the Standard Sign Ordinance and make possible improvements at the same time.

Motion by Mr. Williams

Seconded by Mr. Boyle that the Planning Board set a public hearing date of September 12, 2018 to consider eliminating the Overlay Sign Standards in Article 03, section 3.04 (f) of the Zoning Ordinance. Minutes from the HDC and DRB will be included at the time of the public hearing and the materials will be made available to the public and to the Planning Board.

There were no comments from members of the public at 8:46 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Williams, Boyle, Clein, Emerine, Koseck, Ramin, Whipple-Boyce

Nays: None

Absent: Jeffares, Share

07-125-18

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

a. Communications (none)

b. Administrative Approval Requests

- 1997 Villa, Eton Square Apartments -
 - Installation of PVC 6 ft. high lattice fence in between units;
 - Replacing existing wood sections.

- 209 Hamilton Row, Emagine Theater - Added roof screen at new RTU.

- 609 S. Old Woodward Ave., Don Thomas Sporthaus - 40 ft. x 80 ft. tent to be installed in parking lot to sell product for annual sale.

c. Draft Agenda for the next Regular Planning Board Meeting of August 8, 2018

- Bistro public hearing;
- Definition of church/religious institution;
- Triangle District Parking Fund regulations; and
- Projections into the right-of-way.

The board's consensus was that they also wish to review their Action List at the next meeting.

d. Other Business (none)

07-126-18

PLANNING DIVISION ACTION ITEMS

- a. Staff report on previous requests (none)
- b. Additional items from tonight's meeting (none)

07-127-18

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:45 p.m.

Jana L. Ecker
Planning Director